



Universidad Autónoma
de Madrid

Biblos-e Archivo
Repositorio Institucional UAM

Repositorio Institucional de la Universidad Autónoma de Madrid

<https://repositorio.uam.es>

Esta es la **versión de autor** del artículo publicado en:
This is an **author produced version** of a paper published in:

International Migration 55.2 (2017): 39-52

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1111/imig.12278>

Copyright: © 2017 John Wiley & Sons

El acceso a la versión del editor puede requerir la suscripción del recurso

Access to the published version may require subscription

This is the pre-peer reviewed version of the following article: “**Toward a multi-ethnic public sphere? Media consumption in highly diverse districts in Spain**”, which has been published in final form at <http://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.1111/imig.12278/abstract> This article may be used for non-commercial purposes in accordance with Wiley Terms and Conditions for Self-Archiving.

Lobera, J., Arco, V. and Giménez, C. (2017), Toward a multi-ethnic public sphere? Media consumption in highly diverse districts in Spain. *International Migration*, 55: 39–52. doi: 10.1111/imig.12278

Toward a multi-ethnic public sphere? Media consumption in highly diverse districts in Spain

Josep Lobera, Victor Arco & Carlos Giménez

Universidad Autónoma de Madrid

ABSTRACT

This article examines media consumption in highly diverse districts in Spain as representative of recent changes in this field due to new immigration to countries in Southern Europe in times of crisis. Drawing on findings from two surveys, we observed a decrease in access to media specifically aimed at audiences of minority cultures between 2010 and 2012. It is suggested that this decline is not due to a modification in media consumption habits by minority groups, but rather the economic crisis of 2008. Furthermore, we study the consumption of minority media by natives: we observe that youth and more educated individuals consume other cultures’ minority media to a greater extent, particularly the press, radio, and Internet news sources. We suggest that elements are present that public administrations could utilize to further develop a multi-ethnic public sphere. Finally, we explore the emergence of a new *transnational* dimension to the multi-ethnic public sphere.

Keywords

Minority media, multi-ethnic public sphere, interculturalism

INTRODUCTION

The last two decades saw the emergence of new immigration countries in Southern Europe. In Spain, the foreign population multiplied by seven during the first decade of the millennium, becoming one of the world’s main receptors of immigration during this period. Today, more than 4.7 million foreign nationals live in Spain, comprising about 10.2% of the total population. Their presence has deeply changed Spanish society, and the diversity of methods of communication

has increased as a result. As numerous studies have shown, the minority media plays a leading role in the daily life and social integration processes of migrant populations (Cottle, 2000; Martínez Corcuera, 2010; Arnold and Schneider, 2007; Georgiou, 2003). Generally, minority media as much as general-interest media influences the process of intercultural co-existence on a local scale, and it can affect the establishment of social and intercultural relations as well (Huertas *et al.*, 2013, Gómez-Escalonilla, 2008). It is not merely a message conveyor; it serves as a vehicle for the social production of meaning, the central agent of a public space in which conflicts are resolved and visibility is conferred to actors, themes, agendas and proposals. By opposing certain attitudes and assumptions concerning the many “others” in our societies, the media can help overcome stereotypes that breed mistrust and suspicion (Gómez-Escalonilla and San Martín Durán, 2012), thus promoting tolerance and appreciation of diversity as an opportunity. In this context, interculturalism – as complementary to multiculturalism – wishes to encourage communication with and recognition of dynamic identities (Meer and Modood, 2012). However, recent years, marked by the crisis, have resulted in an institutional stagnation, if not a regression, of such initiatives in Spain (Suárez 2012; Gómez-Escalonilla and San Martín, 2009).

Our research focuses on the frequency of media consumption in highly diverse areas, amongst both the native population and that of immigrants, as an example of recent changes in media consumption due to “new” immigration to countries in Southern Europe. We distinguish between the consumption of mainstream media and that of media targeting ethno-cultural minorities. How are specific media initiatives that target migrant populations utilized? Does mixed usage communications media — radio, press, TV and the Internet — exist, or is media consumed in an isolated or compartmentalised fashion for all the communities studied?

The corpus of studies conducted concerning the consumption of communications media by migrants in Spain throughout the past decade is marked by two outstanding traits: on the one hand, a greater proportion of qualitative versus quantitative approaches to the phenomenon (Retis, 2012, 2014; Gómez-Escalonilla, 2013) and on the other, the scarcity of academic research focused on the consumption and reception of these media by the different communities they target. Thus, like in the majority of European countries, quantitative studies about ethnic minority audiences in Spain continue to be a rarity. One of the few exceptions is the Media Study for Immigrants (EMI, in their Spanish initials), conducted by the *Asociación para el Conocimiento de la Población Inmigrante* (ACPI) in 2007 and 2008 to study the habits of media consumption and entertainment in regions with high presence of foreign population.¹ This scarcity has been felt more acutely during the economic crisis and the resulting sharp decline in available media sources (Suárez, 2011; Suárez and Ferrández, 2012).

One of the novel aspects that our study puts forth is a comparative analysis of the consumption of minority media by both the native and the migrant population in highly diverse territories. In Spain, there exists data and research regarding mainstream media consumption by minority groups, such as that conducted by Huertas *et al.* (2013) and Soriano (2009), but none that takes

¹ Its objective was to “be the industry benchmark [...] and provide objective and recurrent information in a niche market, that of immigrants, which is gaining a momentous strategic importance in the advertising market” (ACPI, 2007:2)

a comparative approach by including non-mainstream media consumption. We take into account this dual dimension in the contexts studied. This allows us to focus the discussion and delve further into the framework of the multi-ethnic public sphere proposed by Husband (2000). For the multi-ethnic character of the public sphere to exist, there must be a transcultural use of media, although this definition in itself is insufficient.² In other words, the media designed and created within a cultural context is consumed by people from other cultural contexts. The greater the transcultural use of media, the broader the multi-ethnic character of the public sphere.

CONSUMPTION OF MINORITY MEDIA

Communicational processes are key to the formation of cultures (Hall, 1974; Martín Barbero, 2003; Curran, Morley and Walkerdine, 1998) and are therefore central to social changes that accompany increases in cultural diversity in many societies. The use of communications media is part of what Hall (1973) termed “linked but distinctive moments,” meaning that it is not detached from the rest of practices and meanings in the process of production-circulation-distribution-consumption-reproduction. In highly diverse territories, media additionally plays a “key role in specific environments in recomposing day-to-day transnational relationships, in terms of affective and family ties, as well as group, neighbourhood and even national ties” (Huertas, 2009). In a more general sense, it also plays a key role in the visibility and recognition of the diverse individuals coexisting in these environments and, thus, in their intercultural relations.

In a time of globalization, communicative connectivity is becoming more and more deterritorialized. Jan Nederveen Pieterse (1995) distinguished “territorial” from “translocal” understandings of culture. While the territorial understanding of culture is inward-looking, endogenous, and identity-based, translocal concepts of culture are outward-looking, exogenous, and hybridity-based. Media cultures today can be understood as translocal phenomena. While certain cultural patterns in media communication remain national-centered – in the sense that the nation and its territory are important reference points for their articulation of meaning –, increasing forms of media culture are much more related to deterritorial entities that lie beyond the national context (Hepp, 2009; Robins, 2006). In this sense, media cultures are best described as a kind of “thickening” of translocal processes for the articulation of meaning that are more or less locally specific (Hepp and Couldry 2009:10). Such a theorization opens the possibility of conceptualizing territorialization, and deterritorialization, as contested practices through which specific cultures are articulated in their particularity—by the media and beyond (García Canclini 1995; 2001; Tomlinson 1999).

Husband (2000) examines majority and minority media around the notion of *differentiated citizenship*. This notion considers not only minorities’ *right to communicate*, but also the *right to be understood* (Saucedo, 2014: 55). This right to participate in the media sphere must take into account how power relations between different “ethnic” majority and minority communities and

² To Husband (2000), the multi-ethnicity of the public sphere should not be based only on the multi-ethnic use of media and its resulting effects on publics. The existing diversity must be equally present in media production processes, in the content itself, and public administrations must also play an active role to guarantee equitable development of communication.

their internal cohesion play a fundamental role in shaping the media infrastructure and media policy (Husband and Downing, 2005). Thus, through these concepts, we see the idea of the revision of the role of the State in supporting minority media, which indicates a need to create or increase participatory mechanisms for minorities in the mainstream media through legislation and financing to avoid the formation of separate, differentiated spheres within Spanish society (Ferrández 2012; Suárez 2011).

We distinguish between general-interest media and specialised media targeting specific audiences, in our case ethnic and cultural minorities (Willem, 2011; Rigoni and Saitta, 2012). The plurality of concepts found in the literature highlights the diversity of theoretical approaches in which the confluence of communications media and migratory processes can be studied: minority media (Camauër, 2003), ethnic media (Karim, 1998; Rigoni, 2003), immigrant media (Ferrández, 2007), diasporic media (Tsagarousianou, 2001; Georgiou, 2003), and the media space of diasporas (Fazal and Tsagarousianou, 2002; Retis, 2008). These concepts are associated with two different analytical foci: while the concepts of minority media, ethnic media, and immigrant media are targeted towards immigrants living in the same country, diasporic media is directed at dispersed communities in several countries. In both cases, global consumption of media allows individuals to accrue common references and to build shared identities and communities of meaning (Morley and Robins, 1995). Thus, migrants' imagined transnational communities have arose. Migrants maintain tight transnational links with their societies of origin and "even become integrated into imagined deterritorialized, pan-ethnic communities" (Park, 2004:276). Deterritorialisation of identities is analysed by many theorists (e.g. García Canclini, 1995; Morley and Robins, 1995; Tomlinson, 1999). As Morley (1994) points out, the question of what is foreign to who may not necessarily be, primarily, a matter of nationality – it can be a matter of ethnicity, class, region, gender or generation.

In our work we use the concept of minority media as an analytical category, meaning that we are referencing not only media produced and/or directed by/at migrants but for other specific cultural groups, including second-generation culture groups. On the other hand, we decided to study the consumption of minority media not only in reference to their potential target but also among natives. We understand there are convergent processes and that they reduce structural barriers between the general-interest and those directed at specific cultural groups. In an era of audience fragmentation, we also observe a certain convergence in this type of minority media, crossing the hypothetical fragmentation by collectives. We are interested in studying minority media consumption among natives to estimate what potential impact these forms of media may have on the construction of a multiethnic public sphere, as well as combining it with the consumption of general-interest media made by minorities.

The existence of *minority media diversification* is in itself insufficient to achieve the consolidation of the multi-ethnic public sphere. It is also necessary to establish a dialogue between minority and mainstream media. In other words, these spheres must not be exclusive but rather interconnected. Husband (2000) envisions the multi-ethnic public sphere as an ideal situation in terms of content, production and audience. The data we present here allow us to comprehend how audiences are forming in highly diverse territories, how to analyse the fragmentation of audiences — a contemporary global phenomenon — and how minority media surpasses the

target audience.

The analysis presented is based on data obtained from two surveys on intercultural coexistence at the local level (anonymized, 2014): 1) *First Survey on Intercultural Coexistence on the Local Level 2010*, consisting of 8928 face-to-face interviews with residents in 25 highly-diverse territories in Spain, conducted from November 3rd to December 10th, 2010, and 2) *Second Survey on Intercultural Coexistence on the Local Level 2012*, consisting in 9323 face-to-face interviews with residents, conducted from September 10th to October 15th, 2010 in the 25 same highly diverse territories as the *First Survey of 2010* (Appendix A). The general characteristics of super-diversity identified by Vertovec (2006, 2007) in certain contexts in Britain appear in a similar fashion in these territories. On average, 29.9% of the population of those territories is foreign. Foreign nationalities with the greatest presence are Moroccans (15.3%), Romanians (10.1%), Ecuadorians (7.3%) and Pakistanis (6.5%). Additionally, about 5% of Spaniards living in these territories self-identify as Roma.

The surveys examined different aspects of coexistence and daily life in these highly diverse territories. A set of questions enquired about the use of communications media (press, radio, TV and the Internet) targeting the general public and media that specifically targeted certain cultural minorities. This data, analysed separately according to age and nationality, allowed us to assess to what extent the existing social reality regarding media consumption in these highly diverse territories approached the ideal situation of the multi-ethnic public sphere (Husband, 2000)

Table 1. Use of communications media 2010-2012, according to birthplace and age
"Usually or rather frequently...?"

	2010		2012				
	Born in Spain	Born abroad	Born in Spain	Born abroad	Ages 18 - 34	Ages 35 - 54	Age 55 and over
<i>Base</i>	6,307	1,975	6,806	2,517	3,439	3,440	2,444
Reads periodicals related to a certain migrant community or cultural group, i.e., Latino, etc.)							
Yes	3	37	3	28	12	11	4
No	96	62	97	72	87	88	96
DK/NA (Do not know/no answer)	<1	<1	<1	<1	<1	<1	<1
Reads general interest periodicals (El País, El Mundo, etc.)							
Yes	68	57	63	58	58	69	56
No	32	43	37	42	42	30	43
DK/NA	<1	<1	<1	<1	<1	<1	<1
Listens to radio stations or broadcasts related to a certain migrant community or cultural group							
Yes	3	33	3	26	13	9	3
No	96	66	96	73	86	90	96
DK/NA	<1	<1	1	1	1	1	1
Listens to general interest radio							
Yes	74	58	69	60	62	70	67
No	26	41	31	39	37	29	33
DK/NA	<1	<1	<1	1	1	1	<1
Watches TV stations or programmes related to a certain migrant community or cultural group (i.e., Canal Latino, Al Jazeera, etc.)							
Yes	3	49	4	43	21	15	4
No	96	50	96	57	78	85	95
DK/NA	1	<1	<1	<1	1	<1	1
Watches general interest TV							
Yes	94	89	93	90	90	93	95
No	6	10	6	9	9	7	5
DK/NA	<1	<1	<1	1	1	<1	<1
Uses current affairs websites related to a certain migrant community or cultural group							
Yes	4	45	7	54	33	19	4
No	96	54	92	45	67	81	96
DK/NA	<1	<1	<1	<1	<1	<1	<1
Uses websites related to Spanish current affairs							
Yes	46	51	50	64	72	61	20
No	54	49	49	36	27	39	80
DK/NA	<1	<1	<1	<1	1	<1	<1

The results obtained indicate, firstly, a decrease in access to media specifically directed to cultural minorities, from 37% to 28% between 2010 and 2012. We did not conclude that this is a modification of media consumption habits by minorities — we have seen that mainstream press consumption amongst foreigners remained at a steady rate in that same time period (57% in 2010 and 58% in 2012) — but rather, it seems to be directly related to the significant decrease in number of newspapers in circulation at that time. Several studies, such as Suarez (2011; 2014) and Villaruel (2011) show that from 2010 most of these newspapers were no longer on the market either because of termination of the operation or a shift to an exclusively digital format.

This phenomenon has been widespread in the media scene, and is due to the impact of the 2010 economic crisis on the media and advertising sectors, an information paradigm shift and changing trends in journalistic convergence, (Thompson, 1999; Quinn, 2004; Pavlik, 2004) in addition to the segmentation or fragmentation of audiences (Livingstone, 2003; Webster, 2005). The crisis of public finances in Southern European countries, in addition, has seriously affected the institutional initiatives to promote intercultural communication and minority media, especially at the local level. In this context, our data proves that the decrease in newspapers in circulation has changed media consumption habits of minority audiences and not the opposite.

In another vein, our data shows that shared media spaces exist between individuals born in Spain and abroad, especially regarding press, radio and mainstream TV (Table 1). This means that there is no compartmentalised or exclusive consumption of mainstream media. In this sense, general-interest periodicals, such as *El País* or *El Mundo*, are read at one time or another by two out of three Spaniards and nearly half of all foreign nationals. We can thus witness that the consumption of mainstream traditional media is, on the whole, “integrating” in nature. These shared media spaces amongst peoples of different cultures can foster the building of bridges and similar meanings in the perception of social realities.

However, the Spaniards’ consumption of media targeted toward other cultural contexts is very low: only 3% of individuals born in Spain read periodicals related to some migrant community or cultural group. Additionally, we see minorities themselves gaining little access to media directed toward specific ethno-cultural audiences. The lack of public accessing the media directed toward specific groups indicates a wasted opportunity for creating that *multi-ethnic public sphere* envisaged by Husband (2000) and is proof of the minor impact of specialised media in the territories under study, in contrast to the role of general-interest or mainstream media.

In order to better understand the media consumption of immigrant populations, we separately analyse the results for the three foreign nationalities with greatest presence in Spain: Ecuadorians, Romanians and Moroccans. These are three groups from different continents, and cultural contexts as well. Amongst these three groups, Ecuadorians – native Spanish speakers – have greater access to all types of media spaces, both mainstream and those related to a specific migrant or cultural group. Thus, 72% of Ecuadorians access mainstream radio as compared to 56% and 59% of Moroccans and Romanians, respectively. 74% regularly access mainstream periodicals compared to 45% and 49% of Moroccans and Romanians, respectively (Appendix B). This greater consumption of mainstream general-interest media could be linked to linguistic factors. However, about 45% of Ecuadorians consult periodicals, radio and TV programmes directed to a specific ethno-cultural audience. This percentage increases to up to 67% in the case of Internet pages related to migrant communities. Consumption of minority media on the part of the Ecuadorian population is remarkably higher than that found amongst Moroccan and Romanian populations. In this case, it seems clear that linguistic reasons are not the origins of the higher incidence of consumption of minority media, as we will debate presently.

Within the media offerings available, we make a distinction between that produced at local, regional and state levels, and also that produced in other countries. In the case of the latter, the consumption may come from either native or migrant populations, normally responding to a search for media production close to their culture of origin. In the analysis of media consumption

it is important to take into account the reality of the growing reach of transnational media consumed in countries other than those in which it is produced. Today, local media is increasingly acquiring transnational accessibility and consumption by means of the Internet. Here we introduce the concept of *transnational multi-ethnic public sphere*, into which we could insert the consumption of media produced in other countries, observed on a local level. In the *transnational multi-ethnic public sphere* construct, the transnational public sphere of Habermas (1998) coincides with the ideal multi-ethnic character envisaged by Husband (2000). This concept is useful to us in order to identify the emergence of relational processes of a transnational dimension reflected in local social life. In the restricted but emerging transnational multi-ethnic public sphere, communications media that is considered mainstream in the country of production can be considered specific in other national contexts where it is accessible and consumed.

FACTORS AFFECTING MINORITY MEDIA CONSUMPTION

Data analysis indicates two main factors determining minority media consumption: age and educational levels. Consistently in diverse countries, educational levels appear related to the consumption of written press (Schoenbach *et al.*, 1999: 233) and of the Internet (Losh, 2004). This same correlation is observed in the case of minority media: the higher the educational level, the more likely the frequent consumption of press and Internet related to specific ethno-cultural communities amongst audiences born both in and outside Spain (Table 2).

Table 2. Logit regression results, minority media consumption by Spanish-born population

Dependent Variables: Reads periodicals related to a migrant community or cultural group; Listens to radio stations or broadcasts related to a certain migrant community or cultural group; Watches TV stations or programmes related to a certain migrant community or cultural group; Uses current affairs websites related to a certain migrant community or cultural group.

	Periodicals		Radio		TV		Internet	
	Sig.	Exp(B)	Sig.	Exp(B)	Sig.	Exp(B)	Sig.	Exp(B)
Age	.042	.991	.002	.986	.000	.981	.000	.967
Primary education	.000		.106		.457		.000	
Secondary education	.001	2.218	.064	1.475	.714	1.063	.007	1.563
Tertiary education	.000	4.861	.043	1.648	.252	1.255	.000	4.342
Gender (women)	.278	1.167	.300	1.163	.370	1.117	.158	.872
Constant	.000	.019	.000	.037	.000	.087	.000	.179

In addition, age appears related to the consumption of minority press, radio, TV and Internet pages. Younger people make habitual use of media related to some migrant community or cultural group. The percentages range from 33% of young people surfing websites related to migrant communities to 12% reading periodicals of the same nature. These proportions are quite a bit higher than the values obtained for adults over 55 years of age, which stand at a mere 4% in all cases. This greater youth consumption in minority media should be considered in the creation of public policies, as it demonstrates, in the near future, that media produced within or for a specific ethno-cultural community could achieve greater prominence in the

media sphere, in a context of fragmentation of audiences and specialisation of publics.

Youth, no matter their origins, consume minority cultural media to a greater extent; this varies according to the type of media in question. This generational divergence is remarkably greater in the case of the Internet. This difference is consistent with the digital generational gap factor existing in Spain (Abellán *et al.*, 2014:5) and with changing media consumption and use habits in young people (López *et al.*, 2011). Moreover, the existence of an increased permeability/flexibility in *media transculturality*, influenced by the highly diversified contexts in which these young people live, is worthy of study. This could be a factor that contributes to the generational divergence and to the growing presence of “multicultural” content in recreational spaces populated by young people.

The reasons for consuming minority media vary considerably between those born in Spain and those born abroad. Amongst the latter, the reasons mainly focus on staying informed on the current affairs in their country of origin (86%), while other reasons are much less frequently mentioned, such as fun and entertainment (16%). These types of media thus mainly play the role of connector with the country of origin, with which many immigrants feel a strong sense identification and belonging (anonymized, 2014:174-8). This motivation, preserving the ties with the current affairs of one’s country of origin, is very similar among the different national groups analysed (Table 3).

Table 3. Reasons for minority media consumption 2012, main minorities

“What are your reasons for reading and accessing these periodicals, radio programmes, TV stations and Internet sites related to a certain migrant or cultural group?” (Multiple answers allowed, no pre-determined answers were provided).

	Origin		Origin		
	Born in Spain	Born abroad	Ecuadorian	Moroccan	Romanian
<i>Base</i>	712	1,567	217	267	136
To stay abreast of current affairs in THEIR country	10	86	88	89	97
To know more about OTHER cultures	44	10	8	7	5
To learn other languages	3	2	1	1	<1
For fun or entertainment	22	16	23	14	15
Because they understand them/they are in their language	1	9	1	17	10
Because they find points of view not found in other media	17	4	3	2	4
For work	4	<1	<1	<1	<1
Others	5	1	1	1	1
DK/NA	16	5	6	5	2

Consumption of media targeting ethno-cultural minorities is very low amongst native Spaniards. Due to their motivation for consuming certain types of media, however, this limited audience of Spaniards consuming this media can be the seed for the emergence of the multi-ethnic public sphere put forward by Husband. Audiences born in Spain claim a wider range of motivating factors than those born abroad. They more often state them to be: desire to know more about

other cultures (44%), fun and entertainment (22%) and finding points of view not found in other media (17%).

Furthermore, data analysis indicates that the consumption of minority media and general-interest or mainstream media (press, radio and TV) by different cultural groups in Spain is not the result of a language different than the native tongue of the country, as is observed in other European countries such as France and the United Kingdom (Rigoni, 2003; Husband, 1999). The emergence of minority media initiatives does not seem to be based on criteria of language comprehension nor on the number of members of a specific ethno-cultural group. Moroccans and Romanians are the two nationalities with the greatest presence in Spain, yet have practically no media specifically targeted to serve their communities (Suárez, 2011:11). These groups, therefore, are less frequent consumers of minority media, but not of mainstream media. In line with other previous studies such as Huertas *et al.* (2013), we find that mainstream TV watching amongst the Moroccan population (92%) in these territories is practically the same as that of the Spaniards (93%).

Thus, the main criteria for the consumption of minority media seems to be the accessibility and the use of media that different minorities have developed historically. We can see an example in the Latin American community, as the political and historical uses of radio in Latin America and the Caribbean, were adaptable to the Spanish context, for example, in the migration milieu of Madrid (Ruíz Trejo, 2014). Ecuadorians listen to considerably more radio directed toward their ethnic background (43%) than Moroccans (28%) or Romanians (18%). Similar differences are seen as well in the consumption of minority-targeted press (45%, 15% and 25%, respectively). Other aspects take on greater weight than linguistic variables, such as political economics, ethnic marketing and the creation of specific ad targeting. As noted by Suárez (2011:240), creating a potential audience for the media is “not a ‘natural’ process derived from the physical existence of a collective, but from the fact that this collective functions as a producer and consumer.

CONCLUDING DISCUSSION

Local initiatives promoting minority media have been deeply affected by the economic crisis in Spain, resulting in a stagnation, if not a regression, of development. The quantitative data shown here indicate firstly that the volume of media consumption has remained steady between 2010 and 2012 — two years of serious crisis for media sectors. This data refutes the existence of a general crisis in audiences. The crisis affecting the media (Román and García, 2013) has not translated into a drop in media consumption. However, a decrease in access to press specifically directed to cultural minorities — from 37% to 28%, between 2010 and 2012 — has been observed. This modification of media consumption habits by minorities seems to be directly related to the significant decrease in the number of newspapers directed at minorities in circulation at that time (Gómez-Escalonilla, 2013; Retis, 2014). The decrease is mainly attributed to the impact of the economic crisis in the advertising sectors, which is the newspaper industry’s main source of financing, as well as to the sharp reduction of institutional initiatives to promote intercultural communication and minority media at the local level. Our research indicates that the decrease in the number of newspapers targeting ethno-cultural minorities has changed media

consumption habits of minority audiences, and not the opposite.

In another vein, language does not seem to be a main conditioning factor influencing media consumption in highly diversified territories, contrary to what occurs in other countries such as France and the United Kingdom (Rigoni, 2003; Husband, 1999). We have seen that Ecuatorians – native Spanish speakers – show high rates of consumption of non-mainstream media directed toward ethnic minorities, and, in some cases, the highest rates. In the Spanish context, the fundamental influential factors in media consumption appear to be the accessibility of minority media and the nature of different minorities' usage in the past.

Foreign nationals mainly make use of minority media to remain informed about the current affairs in their countries of origin. This observation coincides with the data presented in anonymized (2014:174-8) on feelings of belonging and identification of foreign nationals at different levels of sociocultural integration as well as with the theorization of deterritorialisation of identities (García Canclini, 1995; Morley and Robins, 1995; Tomlinson, 1999). The greatest sense of identity for foreigners in Spain exists firstly with their country of origin and secondly with their district of residence (anonymized, 2014:174). Foreign nationals do not renounce their identities constructed before their arrival in Spain, and in this sense, the media are one of the links that allow them to keep these identities alive; it is the strongest sociocultural link uniting them with their country of origin. Consumption of minority media motivated by a sense of belonging is one of the most relevant functions of this type of media, as is the diffusion of useful information to a minority community through local or district-wide journalism. The two main levels of sociocultural identification for foreign nationals are represented in local minority media: their culture of origin and the culture of their district or township where they reside. This kind of journalism manages to combine territorialised and deterritorialised identities for the minorities that consume them.

The Spanish-born population, on the other hand, consumes minority media mainly for entertainment reasons and to broaden their knowledge of other cultures they may or may not encounter in their normal surroundings. This reason is especially relevant to us as it reflects a use of minority media that has not been sufficiently examined: its potential use as a tool for ethno-cultural dissemination and intercultural dialogue. Although there is a small audience of Spanish origin, this type of media usage may allow us a window into the emergence of one of Husband's dimensions of the multi-ethnic public sphere (2000). It points to the importance of public administrations contributing to the existence and sustainability of this type of media, given its potential as an instrument and enabler of integration and coexistence in contexts of high diversity. Greater usage of minority media by youth indicates that, in the near future, media produced by and for a specific ethno-cultural group can gain importance in the media sphere, as different generations utilize media for different purposes and applications.

A multi-ethnic public sphere is still far from reality. However, our study suggests that elements are present that public administrations could capitalize on to further develop it. Furthermore, we suggest the need to consider the emergence of a new *transnational* dimension to this multi-ethnic public sphere, in which media considered to be mainstream in its country of production is accessible and consumed in other national contexts where it is considered to be minority

media. The rapid increase in accessibility to these media via the Internet, regardless of its audience ratings, suggests the need for more specific analysis of this *transnational* multi-ethnic public sphere. As Hannerz (1996) shows, cross-cultural identity formation is at the core of modern cosmopolitanism. A development of a multi-ethnic public sphere –and, widely, a transnational multi-ethnic public sphere– would contribute to the formation of cross-cultural shared identities and communities of meaning. Public policies at all levels – local, national, regional, and international – need to promote access to minority media through actions that could range from recovering local newspapers to facilitating access to transnational media. All these would foster the creation of a new multi-ethnic public sphere, a key element in intercultural communication and modern cosmopolitan societies.

APPENDIX A: LIST OF TERRITORIES UNDER STUDY (CENSUS DATA, JANUARY 1, 2011)

Name of the territory, city (Region); population;% foreigners:

Blas Infante and las Colombinas, Lepe (Andalusia)	27,241	19.4%
Carrús, Elche (Valencian Community)	36,282	21.7%
Centre, San Nicasio and Batallas, Leganés (Community of Madrid)	24,758	22.9%
Daimiel (Castile-La Mancha)	18,673	6.7%
El Clot de Sant Martí, Barcelona (Catalonia)	27,379	14.1%
El Raval de Ciutat Vella, Barcelona (Catalonia)	47,7	47.8%
Historical Quarter, Zaragoza (Aragon)	46,601	19.2%
La Coma, Paterna (Valencian Community)	6,378	9.6%
Las Margaritas, Getafe (Community of Madrid)	11,106	33.3%
Las Norias de Daza, El Ejido (Andalusia)	8,625	57.1%
Lavapiés, Madrid (Community of Madrid)	24,6	38.6%
Les Roquetes, Trinitat Nova and Verdum, Barcelona (Catalonia)	35,999	19.6%
Madre de Dios and San José, Logroño (La Rioja)	24,758	22.9%
Northern District, Granada (Andalusia)	39,682	8.5%
Northern Zone of Nou Barris, Barcelona (Catalonia)	12,639	28.2%
Palma-Palmilla, Málaga (Andalusia)	22,12	7.9%
Playa Honda, San Bartolomé (Canary Islands)	18,468	23.0%
Pueblo Nuevo, Madrid (Community of Madrid)	64,269	21.7%
Salt (Catalonia)	30,389	42.5%
San Francisco and Zabala, Bilbao (Basque Country)	16,95	22.0%
Sigüenza (Castile-La Mancha)	4,947	17.5%
Southern District, Jerez de la Frontera (Andalusia)	30,817	12.8%
Teguise (Canary Islands)	20,788	26.6%
Tortosa (Catalonia)	34,432	20.0%
Universidad, Madrid (Community of Madrid)	33,312	26.6%
<i>Total</i>	<i>668,913</i>	<i>23.0%</i>

APPENDIX B. USE OF COMMUNICATIONS MEDIA 2012, ACCORDING TO COMMUNITY

Appendix. Use of communications media 2012, according to community

<i>“Usually or rather frequently...?”</i>	Community groups			
	Roma	Ecuadorian	Moroccan	Romanian
<i>Base</i>	<i>644</i>	<i>295</i>	<i>457</i>	<i>243</i>
Reads periodicals related to a migrant community or cultural group				
Yes	2	45	15	25
No	98	55	85	71
DK/NA	<1	<1	1	4
Reads general interest periodicals				
Yes	37	74	45	49
No	63	26	55	51
DK/NA	<1	<1	<1	<1
Listens to radio stations or broadcasts related to a migrant community or cultural group				
Yes	3	43	28	18
No	97	57	71	80
DK/NA	<1	<1	1	2
Listens to general interest radio				
Yes	52	72	56	59
No	48	27	43	41
DK/NA	<1	<1	1	<1
Watches TV stations or programmes related to a migrant community or cultural group				
Yes	6	46	64	45
No	93	54	36	53
DK/NA	1	<1	<1	1
Watches general-interest TV				
Yes	92	94	92	91
No	8	6	6	6
DK/NA	<1	<1	2	3
Uses current affairs websites related to a certain migrant community or cultural group				
Yes	7	67	44	52
No	92	33	55	47
DK/NA	1	<1	1	1
Uses websites related to Spanish current affairs				
Yes	31	74	50	67
No	68	26	49	33
DK/NA	<1	<1	1	<1

REFERENCES

- Abellán, A., J. Vilches and R. Pujol
2013 "Un perfil de las personas mayores en España, 2014. Indicadores estadísticos básicos", *Informes Envejecimiento en red*. Vol 6, Madrid, CSIC.
- ACPI
2007 "Estudio de Medios para Inmigrantes. Resumen General EMI 2007", Madrid, Asociación para el Conocimiento de la Población Inmigrante.
- Arnold, A.N. and B. Schneider
2007 "Communicating separation?: Ethnic media and ethnic journalists as institutions of integration in Germany". *Journalism*, 8 (2): 115-136.
- Camauër, L.
2003 "Ethnic minorities and their media in Sweden. An overview of the media landscape and State minority media policy", *Nordicom Review 2/2003*, 69-88.
- Cottle, S.
2000 *Ethnic Minorities and the Media*, Maidenhead, Open University Press.
- Curran, J. D. Morley and V. Walkerdine, eds.
1996 *Cultural Studies and Communications*. London, Arnold, Hodder Headline Group.
- Fazal, S. and R. Tsagarousianou
2002 "Diasporic Communication: Transnational Cultural Practices and Communicative Spaces", *Javnost-The Public* 9: 5-18.
- Ferrández, A.
2007 "Cuatro relaciones entre medios de comunicación y minorías étnicas". *Proceedings of the 5th National Congress of Immigration in Spain*.
- Ferrández, A.
2012 "Sobre la experiencia laboral de los periodistas migrantes en un contexto de desregulación laboral: entre la precariedad y la democratización del campo mediático", *Comunicación y Sociedad*, 25 (2): 305-330.
- García Canclini, N.
1995 *Hybrid Cultures. Strategies for Entering and Leaving Modernity*, Minneapolis, Minnesota University Press.
- García Canclini, N.
2001 *Consumers and Citizens. Globalization and Multicultural Conflicts*, Minneapolis, Minnesota University Press.
- Georgiou, M.
2003 *Mapping diasporic media across the EU. Addressing Cultural Exclusion, European Media Technology and Everyday Network, 2000-2003 (EMTEL) LSE & PS*.
- Gómez-Escalonilla, G., ed.
2008 "Voces de la inmigración. Medios latinos en Madrid", Madrid, Editorial Universitat.
- Gómez-Escalonilla, G. and M. San Martín Durán

- 2009 "Voces Latinas: El periodismo de la inmigración". Proceedings of the First International Congress of Social Communication America, Universidad de La Laguna, Tenerife.
Gómez-Escalonilla, G. and M. San Martín Durán
- 2012 "Los medios inmigrantes como referentes de certidumbre social. Análisis de prensa latina en las capitales de EE.UU y España". *Prisma Social: Revista de Ciencias Sociales*, 8: 49-86.
Habermas, J.
- 1998 *Die postnationale Konstellation*, Frankfurt am Main, Suhrkamp Verlag.
Haf Gruffydd Jones, E. and E. Uribe-Jongbloed
- 2013 *Social media and minority languages. Convergence and the creative industries*, Bristol, Multilingual Matters.
Hall, S.
- 1974 *Encoding and Decoding in the Television Discourse*, CCCS Stenciled Paper 7, Birmingham, Centre for Cultural Studies UB.
Hannerz, U.
- 1996 *Transnational connections: Culture, people, places*. Taylor & Francis US.
Hepp, Andreas
- 2009 Transculturality as a Perspective: Researching Media Cultures Comparatively. *Forum Qualitative Sozialforschung / Forum: Qualitative Social Research*, 10(1), Art. 26
Hepp, A. and N. Couldry
- 2009 "Media events in globalized media cultures", in: Media events in a global age, edited by N. Couldry, A. Hepp and F. Krotz. Routledge, New York: 1-20.
Huertas, A.
- 2009 "El consumo cultural de los latinoamericanos en Cataluña: integración ciudadana y transnacionalismo", *Congreso de la Asociación de Estudios Latinoamericanos*, Rio de Janeiro.
Huertas, A., Y. Martínez and J. Moreras
- 2013 *Prácticas y consumos mediático-culturales del colectivo marroquí en España*. Madrid, Fundacion Alternativas, Observatorio de Cultura y Comunicación.
Husband, C.
- 1996 "The right to be understood: Conceiving the multi-ethnic public sphere", *Innovation: The European Journal of Social Sciences*, 9 (2): 205-215.
- 1999 "Differentiated citizenship and the multi-ethnic public sphere", *Journal of International Communication*, 5 (1 & 2): 134-148.
- 2000 "Media and the public sphere in multi-ethnic societies", in S. Cottle (Ed) *Ethnic minorities and the media*, Buckingham, Open University Press: 199-214.
Karim, K.H.
- 1998 *From ethnic media to global media: transnational communication networks among diasporic communities*, Working Paper WPTC-99-02, Oxford, UK.
Livingstone, S.
- 2003 "The changing nature of audiences: From the mass audience to the interactive media user", in: A. Valdivia (Ed), *Companion to media studies*, Oxford, Blackwell: 337-359.

López, N., P. González and E. Medina

2011 "Jóvenes y televisión en 2010: Un cambio de hábitos", *Zer: Revista de Estudios de Comunicación*, 16(30): 97-113.

Losh, S.C.

2004 "Gender, educational, and occupational digital gaps 1983-2002", *Social Science Computer Review*, 22(2), 152-166.

Martín Barbero, J.

2003 *De los medios a las mediaciones*, Bogotá, Convenio Andrés Bello.

Martínez Corcuera, R.

2010 "Diasporic media and mainstream media... Tools for integration?" Presented in Minority Media International Conference. An alternative Representation? Ethnic Minority Media, between Hegemony and Resistances, 18-19 March, Poitiers, France.

Meer, N. and T. Modood

2012 "How does Interculturalism Contrast with Multiculturalism?", *Journal of Intercultural Studies*, 33 (2): 175-196.

Morley, D.

1994 "Postmodernism: the highest stage of cultural imperialism?", in M. Perryman (Ed.), *Altered States*, Lawrence & Wishart, London.

2000 *Home Territories*. Routledge, London.

Morley, M. and K. Robins

1995 *Spaces of Identity: Global Media, Electronic Landscapes and Cultural Boundaries*, Routledge, New York.

Nederveen Pieterse, J.

1995 "Globalization as Hybridization", in M. Featherstone, S. Lash and R. Robertson (Eds.), *Global Modernities*, Sage, London: 45-68.

Park, J-S.

2004 "Korean American youths' consumption of Korean and Japanese TV dramas and its implications", in Koichi Iwabuchi (Ed.), *Feeling Asian modernities: Transnational consumption of Japanese TV dramas*, Honk Kong University Press, Honk Kong: 275-300.

Pavlik, J. V.

2004 "A Sea-Change in Journalism: Convergence, Journalists, their Audiences and Sources", *Convergence*, 10: 21-29.

Quinn, S.

2004 "An Intersection of Ideals: Journalism, Profits, Technology and Convergence". *Convergence*, 10 (4): 109-123.

Retis, J.

2008 *Espacios mediáticos de la inmigración en Madrid: Génesis y evolución*, Madrid, Observatorio de las Migraciones y la Convivencia Intercultural de la Ciudad de Madrid.

Riggins, S. H.

1992 *Ethnic Minority Media: An International Perspective*, London, Sage. Publications.

- Rigoni, I.
 2003 "Ethnic media, an alternative form of citizenship", Presented at the EMTEL Conference, 23–26 April 2003, London School of Economics.
- Rigoni, I. and E. Saitta
 2012 *Mediating cultural diversity in a globalised public space*, Houndmills, Palgrave Macmillan.
- Robins, K.
 2006 "The challenge of transcultural diversities: Final report of the transversal study on the theme of cultural policy and cultural diversity", in K. Robins (Ed.), *The challenge of transcultural diversities*, Council of Europe, Strassbourg: 7-48.
- Román, M. and A. García
 2013 "Crisis económica y grupos de comunicación en España (2008-2011)", *International Journal of Marketing, Communication and New Media*, 1 (1): 124-147.
- Ruíz Trejo, M.G.
 2014 Voices of Latin America and the Caribbean in Latino's radio Madrid: transnational radio practices, *Relaciones Internacionales*, 25: 77-102
- Schoenbach, K., E. Lauf, J.M. McLeod and D.A. Scheufele
 1999 "Distinction and integration: sociodemographic determinants of newspaper reading in the USA and Germany", *European Journal of Communication*, 14 (2): 225-239. London: Sage.
- Saucedo, P.
 2014 "Construyendo una esfera pública multiétnica: El aporte de los medios latinoamericanos en Alemania", *CHASQUI Revista Latinoamericana de Comunicación*, 125: 51-59.
- Soriano, J.
 2009 *Análisis comparado de audiencias y consumos culturales de los extranjeros en Cataluña*, Barcelona, Fundació Bofill.
- Suárez, L.
 2011 "Políticas de Representación: construcción y marketing de nuevas identidades en el espacio político-mediático", *Revista de antropología social*, 20: 229-261.
- Suárez, L. and A. Ferrández
 2012 "Immigrant minority media: Towards a democratisation of the Western mediascape?", in I. Rigoni and E. Saitta E (Eds) *Mediating cultural diversity in a globalised public space*, Houndmills, Palgrave Macmillan: 76-95.
- Thompson, I.
 1999 *Convergence in Television and the Internet*, Londres, Informa Media Group.
- Tomlinson, J.
 1999 *Globalization and Culture*, Oxford, Polity Press.
- Tsagarousianou, R.
 2001 "A space where one feels at home. Media consumption practices among London's South Asian and Greek Cypriot communities", in R. King and N. Wood (Eds) *Media and migration: constructions of mobility and difference*, London, Routledge: 158-72.

Vertovec, S.

2006 *The Emergence of Super-Diversity in Britain*, COMPAS Working Paper WP-06-25. Oxford, Oxford University Centre on Migration, Policy and Society.

2007 Super-diversity and its implications, *Ethnic and Racial Studies*, 30 (6): 1024-1054.

Webster, J.

2005 "Beneath the veneer of fragmentation. Television audience polarization in a multichannel world". *Journal of Communication*, 55 (2): 366-382.

Willem, C.

2011 *Minorías en red. Medios y migración en Europa*, Col·lecció Transmedia XXI, Barcelona, Laboratori de Mitjans Interactius, Universitat de Barcelona.